Beyond Security: Reimagining Mental Health Care in Palestinian Communities Affected by Administrative Detention and Military Violence

ABSTRACT

This research aims to examine the profound impact of administrative detention and military violence on Palestinian youth within the ongoing Israel-Palestine conflict, particularly focusing on the social and psychological effects of trauma. Israel's use of administrative detention has sparked controversy, as these aggressive measures violate fundamental human rights and perpetuate violence and insecurity in the region. This study seeks to highlight the efforts of organizations and medical professionals striving to develop effective mental health interventions within this unique context. By challenging the common perception that Palestinian youth are agentless victims, the objective of this paper is to advocate for a comprehensive mental health framework, which acknowledges the unique context of life within the Occupied Territories and encourages engagement in the collective anticolonial struggle for freedom.

Administrative detention, defined by its arbitrary nature and indefinite duration, not only violates the fundamental rights of individuals but also inflicts permanent trauma on the collective consciousness of the Palestinian community. To understand and address the perpetuation of violence, it is necessary to take a broader look at global security paradigms and their inadvertent contributions to the escalation of conflict. By examining the unintended consequences of security strategies, this study aspires to pave the way for a global security framework that transcends regional boundaries and promotes sustainable solutions by placing human rights and collaboration at its core. My goal is to amplify the voices of those affected by violence, approach my analysis with sensitivity and care, and advocate for interventions that prioritize justice and security, extending this commitment to the well-being of Palestinians and global citizens alike.

ADMINISTRATIVE DETENTION IN THE OPT

Since its establishment in 1948, Israel has employed administrative detention as one of its core security strategies, directed explicitly at preventing terrorists from carrying out attacks before they occur. However, beneath this stated objective lies an implicit function of these arbitrary arrests – a function that goes well beyond prevention. These detentions are systematically employed to contain, control, and intimidate the occupied population for the larger purpose of deterring any form of resistance. Arbitrary detentions represent only one facet of the broader array of security measures employed by the Israeli military to silence dissent, maintain control, and prevent any disruption of the current status quo of Israel's occupation. Inevitably, these intended effects are accompanied by a myriad of less desirable outcomes; among them, the traumatization of an entire population, including children who make up almost half of Palestinian society (Awad, PCBS).

Under international law, limited use of administrative detention is permitted only under extreme circumstances, namely when there is a clear and imminent threat to the existence of a state. "Israel has claimed to be under a continuous state of emergency" since its inception, justifying its use of extreme measures to contain the supposed threat of Palestinian resistance (Adameer, "Stop Administrative Detention"). The Israeli government disregards the conditions governing its use, as detainees are deprived of their fundamental rights to a fair trial, legal representation, protection against abuse, and any opportunity to challenge their arrest or unjust treatment. Not only does the state justify the arbitrary arrest of men and women loosely suspected of being materially involved in terrorist networks, but it is also "the only country in the world that automatically and systematically prosecutes children in military courts" (DCIP, "Military Detention"). Despite a universal consensus regarding the inherent innocence of

children, particularly within discourses of armed conflict, Israel detains, interrogates, and prosecutes hundreds of Palestinian children annually. "Approximately 700 Palestinian children aged 12 to 17 are arrested by the Israeli army each year," raising concerns from the international community about the impact of these practices on the well-being and future development of this significant population (UNICEF, Question of Palestine).

IMPACT ON CHILDREN AND THE REPRODUCTION OF VIOLENCE

In addition to the unjust cause for the arrest of most of these children, human rights reports have cited countless instances of ill-treatment, including but not limited to: slapping, beating, kicking, verbal and psychological abuse, humiliation, sexual harassment, and threats of rape (Addameer, "Children"). A study on the abuse of Palestinian children's rights reveals that over "90% of children have been arrested on suspicion of throwing stones at Israeli soldiers" - a crime that has warranted a sentence of up to 20 years (Siraj Sait). This staggering statistic highlights the disproportionate measures employed against Palestinian children, amounting to the collective punishment of the entire population despite their innocence. A UNICEF report elucidates the horror of these experiences, finding that children are commonly "arrested at their homes between midnight and 5:00 am, blindfolded, painfully restrained, physically and verbally abused, deprived of water and food, and interrogated using physical violence and threats of sexual assault or death" (UNICEF, "Question of Palestine").

The short and long term consequences of these experiences cannot be understated. They must be acknowledged as a catalyst not only for developmental issues but also for the emergence of a violent sentiment that factors into the collective identity of the Palestinian people. Studies show that Palestinian children become increasingly aggressive, fearful, anxious, irritable, and rebellious as a result of this material reality. Even if they do not experience detainment firsthand,

"traumatic events like the humiliating detention of fathers and brothers are causing irreparable damage to children... and they come to accept violence as a good method for resolving problems" (Siraj Sait). When children lose all faith in the authorities and institutions meant to keep them safe, they often learn from a young age that ensuring their safety and that of their loved ones requires alternative, sometimes violent means.

Dr. Eyad El-Sarraj has written extensively about the psychological impacts of abuse by Israeli soldiers, explaining how "the suicide bombers of the second intifada are the children of the first Intifada – people who witnessed a great deal of trauma as children" (El-Sarraj, "On Violence and Resistance"). He goes on to warn that "violence against civilians only serves to deepen the fear and insecurity of any population, thus making it hostage to militaristic propensity, and dependent on extremist ideals" (El-Sarraj). By drawing a connection between the trauma endured during childhood and the emergence of violence later in life, he emphasizes the cyclical pattern that perpetuates violence through generations, particularly when feelings of injustice and victimization take root in children as young as 12 years old. The reproduction of violence that ensues from these experiences has therefore turned Israel, "which was supposed to be a safe haven for Jews of the world, into a slaughterhouse for both Israelis and Palestinians" (El-Sarraj). Unfortunately, Israel's strategy of ensuring the security of its own population through its heavy handed treatment of Palestinians, including children, has unintended consequences that ultimately undermine its interests.

INTERVENTIONS AND CHALLENGES

The plight of Palestinian children caught in the crossfire of Israel's occupation thus remains the focus of countless international organizations' advocacy efforts and campaigns.

These institutions recognize that the arbitrary arrest of children as young as 12 years old cannot

be justified by any claimed "necessity," but amounts to a blatant disregard for the value of Palestinian life and for the standards enshrined in international law to protect innocent civilians and the fundamental human rights of all individuals regardless of race, religion, or nationality.

As the only supposed democracy in the Middle East, Israel should be pressured to uphold universal human rights principles and the rule of law, which are essential for promoting peace and justice both regionally and globally. Unfortunately, calls for greater attention to the rights of children have largely fallen on deaf ears. Israel continues to undermine international law, including the legal restraints in place to limit suffering, particularly of children. The United States, as Israel's strongest ally, has shown similarly limited responsiveness to the urgent need for reform in this regard. It is hard to ignore the irony of the situation, as the very principles and values that both nations profess to uphold for their own citizens, such as human rights and the protection of children, seem to be compromised when they apply to Palestinians. While organizations and individuals should continue to push for legal and political reform, other interventions are necessary as the situation on the ground grows increasingly dire.

In the aftermath of child detention, mental health care is not only essential for individual development, but also carries transformative potential, reshaping narratives of violence and victimhood into a collective commitment to empowerment and resilience. A liberation-based approach anchored in critical consciousness, social justice, and accountability provides survivors of violence with the tools to confront power imbalances and oppression, ultimately promoting resilience and facilitating healing (Rhea Almeida, "Liberation Based Healing Practices").

The obstacles to establishing a robust mental health framework in the OPT are plentiful, exacerbated by the daily challenges of life under military occupation. For instance, "when a nation is struggling with day-to-day survival, the development of evidence-based mental health

policies and services is unlikely to be a priority" (Giacaman). The allocation of resources and attention to mental health needs may be overshadowed by more immediate concerns such as access to basic necessities, security, and survival, all of which are compromised for Palestinians in the OPT. The struggle to implement mental health services in the West Bank and Gaza goes back to 1967 when these efforts were "managed by the Israeli government and became neglected and underdeveloped" (Marie, Hannigan, and Jones). Efforts to revive these systems then became the objective of countless NGOs and international institutions, along with the Palestinian Authority, which remained largely unmotivated in this regard. This brought forth new challenges to the struggle, notably the inapplicability of Western perceptions of trauma and rehabilitation to the context of Palestinian suffering. Western treatments narrowly focused on individual counseling "assume that the pathological effects of war are located inside a person, and can be cured through individual treatment, as if the individual was recovering from an illness rather than suffering from the long-protracted consequences of historical and contemporary political injustice" (Giacaman). The nature of violence and oppression experienced by Palestinians is deeply entrenched in the experiences of historical dispossession, displacement, occupation, and systemic discrimination, making it impossible to translate Western models of trauma to this unique context. Traditional frameworks for mental health care are therefore disempowering and reinforce patriarchal systems by framing survivors as mere victims, neglecting their agency and resilience, and reducing their trauma to some universal experience that overlooks the contextualized nature of their suffering. As a result, efforts have been made by Palestinians to move "away from hospital-based in-patient services to community provision of care" and familial support systems (Marie, Hannigan, and Jones).

For example, *Sumud* is a "Palestinian anticolonial construct wherein the subject [of violence] can be seen not only as a victim, but also as a resisting hero" (Meari). *Sumud* is a mindset that redefines the experience of trauma within the Palestinian context. In interviews with Palestinian boys who had been detained and abused, one of them recalls "suddenly feeling like a lion—a powerful being" (Meari). They express discovering an inner strength within themselves despite their physical pain. The focus shifts away from their own suffering toward protecting their community and having pride in their resilience (Meari). Linking individual suffering to a collective struggle of resistance empowers individuals to endure torture in defense of their "comrades, political organizations, communities, and the Palestinian Revolution," thereby continuing the process of resistance that Palestinians generate through these violent encounters (Meari).

Ignorant to this facet of the Palestinian identity, Western liberal human rights and trauma discourses have been imposed on Palestinians, hindering their ability to heal from experiences deliberately aimed at stripping them of their dignity and agency. For this reason, providing mental health care that is truly empowering and liberating has been a struggle constrained by the international community and Western NGOs, who bring preconceived notions and frameworks that do not resonate with the realities and needs of Palestinians living under occupation.

The fragmentation of healthcare services, coupled with a reliance on international funding and the Western agendas associated with it, has undermined efforts to deliver comprehensive mental health services tailored to Palestinian youth impacted by administrative detention and other forms of military violence. The organizations that do exist, like the Treatment and Rehabilitation Center for Victims of Torture (TRC), have succeeded in part by providing "a healing space where victims of torture can talk about their brutalizing experiences,"

alongside providing psychological services to address medical ailments resulting from such trauma (Meari). In addition to offering rehabilitation and therapy services, TRC also organizes informational workshops for medical professionals and for the families of those affected by violence. These workshops serve as platforms for exchanging of knowledge, encouraging collaboration, and enhancing treatment practices. The organization is committed to "reaching affected cases with maximum speed, using the latest methods and techniques of psychological treatment and intervention, and accelerating the recovery process of the affected and their reintegration into society" (TRC, Rehabilitation Department).

Despite their best efforts, they continue to be plagued by the same constraints and have embraced an ideology that perceives "torture and psychological traumas as individual experiences, thereby depoliticizing and decontextualizing matters of social justice, occupation, and dispossession" (Meari). They define themselves as an "independent and impartial entity," further emphasizing their oversight of the political significance inherent in resistance and healing practices. Dr. Ibrahim Makkawi would critique the impartial stance of the TRC, echoing his criticisms of the Gaza Community Mental Health Program (GCMHP). In his writings, he asserts, "Research which is carried out on colonized communities, such as the Palestinian people, with the presumption to address the psychological consequences of such colonization, cannot and should not be neutral research" (Makkawi). Maintaining these ill-suited paradigms poses the risk of perpetuating a narrative that downplays the specific injustices of the occupation. By applying trauma frameworks designed for Americans and Israelis to treat Palestinians, there is a risk of oversimplifying and homogenizing their experiences and suffering with those of individuals facing vastly different forms of violence. This approach can reinforce an oppressive structure by disregarding the historical and political context of Palestinian trauma. Such oversight perpetuates a resort to the status quo, including systemic inequality, marginalization and extreme insecurity, directly undermining the healing process being sought. Renewed efforts are needed to address these limitations and integrate a more context-specific understanding of trauma within spaces dedicated to healing and empowerment in the OPT.

Looking forward, community-centered mental health approaches should incorporate decolonizing methodologies that not only prioritize therapeutic interventions but also "encourage community pride and participation in activities such as art, dance, film, sports, and political engagement" (Jabr and Berger). By leveraging the rich social fabric embedded in centuries of Palestinian history and communal identity, these initiatives have the power to cultivate holistic well-being within the community. Involving local leaders and inspirational speakers in the healing process would present a multifaceted intervention strategy by connecting individual struggles with the overarching values of collective solidarity and resilience. Through this approach, individuals are uplifted and the community as a whole is strengthened, nurturing a sense of unity and shared purpose in navigating and overcoming challenges.

RESEARCH CHALLENGES

Amidst the ongoing massacre in Gaza since October 2023, and the subsequent violence and devastation throughout the Palestinian community in the West Bank, individuals are overwhelmed and unavailable to engage in discussions regarding the establishment of better-suited mental health services or the challenges they face. With the daily struggle for their lives and the safety of their loved ones, it would be unreasonable to expect them to allocate time and energy toward contemplating these structural changes. In such dire circumstances, it becomes the responsibility of all who are invested in the future well-being of Palestinians, regional peace, and global stability to undertake these efforts and commit to future collaboration

with the resilient communities that arise out of this crisis. By advocating for improved mental health services and addressing the systemic constraints, we can pave the way for the next generation of Palestinians to access the necessary resources to overcome the horrors they have endured and to continue the anticolonial struggle with a commitment to achieve true self governance and determination.

METHODOLOGIES

Pursuing future research on mental health in Palestinian communities will require a thoughtful and ethical approach. Upon arrival in the West Bank, my methodology will involve integrating into the TRC team and aligning my research goals with their overarching objectives. This collaboration will provide me with access to resources, networks, and insights necessary to navigate the complexities of mental health care in the OPT. I will prioritize qualitative and semi-structured interviews with NGO leaders who have firsthand experience working and living within these communities. These interviews will hopefully shed light on existing mental health care practices, challenges, and potential areas for improvement. Immersion within Palestinian communities will be another cornerstone of my methodology, involving active participation in community events, gatherings, and activities. Through these experiences, I aim to build trust and gain firsthand insights into community members' lived experiences and perspectives. To this end, ethnographic methods will be an essential component of my research, employing participant observation and informal conversations to gain a deeper understanding of individual experiences with and perspectives on mental health. My hope is that these experiences will provide a more contextually informed understanding of the subject matter. More importantly, in this process, I hope to build mutually beneficial relationships where I can offer support and assistance to the

communities in as many ways as possible, recognizing the importance of reciprocity and collaboration in producing meaningful change.

GLOBAL RELEVANCE

While it is necessary to directly challenge the practice of administrative detention, it is also important to situate these issues within the broader context of global security. Drawing from the Israeli context, state-based security architectures often prioritize the safety and security of their own citizens, even at the expense of exacerbating the insecurity of others. Consequently, the heightened insecurity experienced by Palestinians exacerbates their sense of injustice, inevitably fueling a need for resistance, which may manifest through violence. Therefore, it becomes evident that the challenge lies not in any inherently Palestinian predisposition to violent action, but instead in a collective learned experience of violence that is a result of the heightened securitization, militarization, and criminalization of everyday life in Palestinian communities.

A human security approach emphasizes addressing the root causes of insecurity, such as poverty, inequality, and lack of access to basic services, rather than solely focusing on military or state-centric solutions (Shannon Beebe). In the context of the OPT, implementing a human security approach would involve targeted interventions aimed at improving the socioeconomic conditions of the population, ensuring their fundamental rights and dignity, and creating spaces for inclusive dialogue and cooperation among all stakeholders to address underlying grievances and build trust. This might include initiatives such as investing in infrastructure, education, healthcare, and economic development, as well as promoting respect for human rights and facilitating meaningful participation of local communities in decision-making processes. A human security approach stands in contrast to the Israeli occupation, where insecurity is heightened rather than alleviated, and so where violence is reproduced rather than diminished.

To intervene in the cycle of violent revolutions and counter-revolutions that have plagued this region for decades, and to safeguard the fundamental rights of Palestinians and human beings everywhere, we must reevaluate the effectiveness of modern security strategies to bring about sustainable peace. We must transcend the 'enemy-centric' perspective, which reproduces a cycle of conflict by framing the situation as an endless struggle for power and dominance between two peoples. Instead, we must be committed to implementing human security for all people, across boundaries of political affiliation and national borders. In a world that prioritizes the security of all its inhabitants, conditions of peace will ultimately prevail. Palestinian doctor, psychiatrist, and human rights defender Eyad El-Sarraj places his hope in the possibility that "a movement is capable of inspiring the beleaguered masses into joining ranks and working together against the tyranny of militants and military dictatorship, in order to instill hope and stretch it to the borders of life" (El-Sarraj). We must carry this hope with us in our endless collective struggle for global security and justice.

REFERENCES:

- H.E Dr. Awad, "Highlights the Palestinian Children's Situation on the Occasion of the Palestinian Child Day." May 04, 2023. Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics.

 PCBS | Dr. Awad, highlights the Palestinian children's situation on the Occasion of the Palestinian Child Day, 05/04/2023.
 - ** The source provides statistical data from the Palestinian Central Bureau of Statistics indicating that nearly half of Palestinian society consists of children. With approximately 2.2 million males and 1.1 million females under the age of 18, this demographic composition underscores significant youth representation in the Palestinian population, with Gaza Strip having a higher proportion at 47%.

Addameer, Prison Support and Human Rights Association, "Stop Administrative Detention" https://www.addameer.org/Campaign/stop-administrative-detention

** This source presents a campaign against administrative detention, shedding light on the issue within the Palestinian context. It advocates for an end to this practice, highlighting its impact on individuals rights and emphasizing the need for legal reform and human rights protection.

Defense for Children International - Palestine. "Military Detention." https://www.dci-palestine.org/military_detention

** This source focuses on military detention of Palestinian children, providing insights into the harsh realities they face within the Israeli military justice system. It highlights systemic violations of their rights and calls for urgent reforms to safeguard the well-being of Palestinian minors subjected to military detention.

United Nations. "United Nations Information System on the Question of Palestine (UNISPAL)." https://www.un.org/unispal/document/auto-insert-208566/

** This source serves as a comprehensive database providing access to a wide array of UN documents, resolutions, and publications related to the Israel-Palestine conflict. It offers a UN-initiated assessment of Israel's military detention of Palestinian children, including an invaluable legal analysis of the violations carried out by the Israeli military.

Addameer Prisoner Support and Human Rights Association. "Children."

https://www.addameer.org/the prisoners/children

** Addameer's section on children provides a platform to explore the plight of Palestinian minors detained by Israeli authorities, offering detailed accounts of their experiences and the legal challenges they face. Through its advocacy and documentation efforts, Addameer sheds light on the human rights violations endured by Palestinian

- children in Israeli military detention, advocating for their rights for broader reform of the detention system.
- Sait, M. Siraj. "Have Palestinian Children Forfeited Their Rights?" *Journal of Comparative Family Studies*, vol. 35, no. 2, Published by University of Toronto Press. https://www.jstor.org/stable/41603933
 - ** This article explores the complex issue of Palestinian children's rights in the context of the ongoing conflict in the region. Sait explores various factors affecting the rights of Palestinian children, including political instability, violence, and displacement, and examines the impact of these factors on their well-being and development.
- El-Sarraj, Eyad. "On Violence and Resistance." Published in the Palestine-Israel Journal. PIJ.ORG: On Violence and Resistance By Eyad El-Sarraj
 - ** This article explores the dynamics of violence and resistance in the Israel-Palestine conflict through insightful analysis, shedding light on the reproduction of violence that has ensued for 75 years and will continue until material conditions change.
- Almeida, Rhea. "Liberation Based Healing Practices." December 19, 2018. Published by the Institute for Family Services.
 - ** Rhea Almeida provides an insightful exploration of healing methodologies rooted in principles of liberation and social justice. Her insights offer a valuable perspective on holistic approaches to healing that prioritize individual and collective empowerment within marginalized communities.
- Giacaman, Rita, Rabaia, Yoke, Nguyen-Gillham, Viet, Batniji, Rajaie, Punamäki, Raija-Leena and Summerfield, Derek (2010) 'Mental health, social distress and political oppression:

 The case of the occupied Palestinian territory', Global Public Health,, First published on:

 23 November 2010 (iFirst)
 - ** This source provides a comprehensive examination of the intersection between mental health, social distress, and political oppression in the occupied Palestinian territory. Through an interdisciplinary lens, the authors highlight the complex interplay of political, social, and psychological factors shaping the mental well-being of Palestinians living under occupation.
- Marie, M., Hannigan, B. & Jones, A. Mental health needs and services in the West Bank, Palestine. *Int J Ment Health Syst* 10, 23, (2016).
 - ** Marie, Hannigan, and Jones (2016) offer a focused analysis of mental health needs and services in the West Bank, Palestine, shedding light on the challenges and gaps in mental healthcare delivery within the region. They provide essential groundwork for further research and the development of effective interventions.

- Meari, L. (2015), RECONSIDERING TRAUMA: TOWARDS A PALESTINIAN COMMUNITY PSYCHOLOGY. J. Community Psychol., 43: 76-86. https://doi.org/10.1002/jcop.21712
 - ** Meari's work offers a critical examination of trauma within the Palestinian context, advocating for a shift towards a community psychology approach. The author challenges conventional perspectives on trauma and underscores the importance of culturally sensitive and community-centered approaches to mental health and healing in Palestine.
- Treatment and Rehabilitation Center for Victims of Torture. (n.d.) Rehabilitation Department. Retrieved from http://english.trc-pal.org/Prg.aspx?ld=5
- Makkawi, I. A. (2009). Towards an Emerging Paradigm of Critical Community Psychology in Palestine. Retrieved from https://api.semanticscholar.org/CorpusID:55698542
- Jabr, S., & Berger, E. (2023). Community mental health, psychoanalysis, and freedom: The case of Palestine. *International Journal of Applied Psychoanalytic Studies*, 20(2), 285–301. https://doi.org/10.1002/aps.1801
- Shannon Beebe and Mary Kaldor. "The Ultimate Weapon is No Weapon: Human Security and the New Rules of War." May 11, 2010. Published by PublicAffairs.
 - ** Shannon Beebe explores the concept of human security and advocates for alternative approaches to conflict resolution beyond traditional military means. Beebe argues for prioritizing human well-being, social justice, and diplomacy to address contemporary security challenges.